that we are struggling for satellite space. In fact, INSAT has got enough spare capacity. I and we feel that we should utilise whatever is indigenous capacity. After we complete it, then, we can go to the other possibilities.

SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR: That is not a security concern. That would have been the right answer.

Accountability of civil servants to Parliament

*123. SHRI R. K. ANAND: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether there is any proposal to make a comprehensive law on civil servants to make them accountable directly to the Parliament;

(b) if so, the details thereof; and

(c) by when will this law be enacted?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS (SHRI SURESH PACHOURI): (A) No, Sir.

(b) and (c) Do not arise.

SHRI R.K. ANAND: Mr. Chairman, Sir, these days the civil servants are not accountable to anyone. They have been becoming subservient to the political masters.

MR. CHAIRMAN: When the Minister is saying 'question does not arise', then, why are you putting the supplementary?

SHRI R.K. ANAND: Sir, please give me one minute. We have seen that public money worth hundreds of crores of rupees is being wasted by the civil servants just to please their bosses. I would like to know from the Minister as to how they are going to make them accountable to the public.

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Mr. Chairman, Sir, as per Article 310 of our Constitution, every civil servant is accountable to the Minister. But, at the same time, as per clause (iii) of article 75 of our Constitution, the Ministers

are responsible and answerable to the Parliament. So, these articles make the Ministers accountable to the Parliament, not the civil servants accountable to the Parliament. Therefore, as per the constitutional provisions, there is not direct parliamentary control over civil servants, and the civil servants operate through the Minister concerned. This is the constitutional provision.

DR. P.C. ALEXANDER: Sir, while Mr. Anand has been unhappy about the answer given by the hon. Minister, I would like to register my great happiness. The Minister has directly answered the question, precisely given the reply, and I am very happy at the position he has taken. But, the underlying assumption in the question appears to be that the civil servants are not accountable. I wish to inform the House and assure the gentleman who made the statement that they are fully accountable and ask a question though indirectly to the legislative whether the Minister is aware that in any place in the world where parliamentary democracy functions, the civil servant is directly accountable to the elected Parliament. I would like to get the answer for that.

SHRI R. SHUNMUGASUNDARAM: Sir, my concern is about the several prosecutions relating to corruption where high officials are involved. We have seen that these scandals or corrupt practices are not possible without the active connivance of the civil servants. They should function as watchdogs.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the question?

SHRI R. SHUNMUGASUNDARAM: Mr. Chairman, Sir, we have seen that the CBI is helpless in many cases. They cannot take it on appeal becasue of the clout of the Civil Servants. Has the Ministry got any plan or is it going to work on some plan to monitor such cases because whenever these Civil Servants are acquitted or discharged, we see no appeal being pursued in the Supreme Court or the High Court? This is my question.

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Mr. Chairman, Sir, as far as the first supplementary put by Dr. P.C. Alexander is concerned, I would like to mention here that there are three countries, New Zealand, U.K.and Switzerland where some provisions are there as far as accountability of Civil Servants to Parliament is concerned. Only Bills are passed, but Acts are not passed. So, I may say that, as per my knowledge, there is no provision anywhere that the Civil Servants are directly accountable to the Parliament.

As far as the question raised by the hon. Member is concerned, there are various provisions in our law like the Prevention of Curruption Act, and other Acts where we can take action against those Civil Servants against whom complaints of curruption are existing.

*124. [*The Questions* (SHRIMATI S.G. INDIRA) *was absent. For answer vide* page 36.]

Indian contribution to United Nations

*125 SHRI MURLI DEORA: Will the Minister of EXTERNAL AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

(a) the contribution paid annually by India to United Nations during the last three years; and

(b) the criteria to fix this contribution?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI RAO INDERJIT SINGH): (a) and (b) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

Indian Contribution to United Nations

(a) Details regarding India's contribution to the UN regular budget during the last three years are as:

Year	Contribution
2004	Rs. 27,98,68,571/- (US $ 61,22,699)
2003	Rs. 22,12,18,692/- (US $ 46,03,927)
2002	Rs. 18,59,79,902/- (US $ 38,64,919)

(b) Contribution from Member States are determined as per a scale of assessment approved by the UN General Assembly on the basis of advice from the Committee on Contributions. The scale is based on the capacity of the Member States to pay, which is determined by considering their relative shares of total gross national product, adjusted to take into account a number of factors, including their per capita incomes. Based on this